Leo S. Ward BROWNING, KALECZYC, BERRY & HOVEN, P.C. 139 N. Last Chance Gulch P.O. Box 1697 Helena, MT 59624-1697

Phone: (406) 443-6820 Fax: (406) 443-6895

ATTORNEYS FOR Valor Insurance Co.

FILED

JUN - 6 2005

OFFICE OF WORKERS' COMPENSATION JUDGE HELENA, MONTANA

IN THE WORKERS' COMPENSATION COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA

DALE REESOR,) WCC No. 2002-0676
PETITIONER, v.)) ANSWER TO SUMMONS AND NOTICE) OF ATTORNEY FEE LIEN
MONTANA STATE FUND,)
Respondent/Insurer))

Pursuant to the Court's Summons and Notice of Attorney Fee Lien, Valor Insurance Co. (Valor) submits the following answer:

Valor objects to common fund certification in this case and asserts the following defenses:

- 1. Petitioner cannot satisfy the three elements for common fund certification set forth in the *Ruhd* decision.
 - 2. Petitioner did not request common fund certification in a timely manner.
- 3. The decision should not be applied retroactively because Petitioner cannot satisfy any of the three *Chevron* factors set forth in the *Dempsey* decision.
- 4. Application of a common fund under the facts of this case would violate provisions of the U.S. and Montana Constitutions, including but not limited to, procedural and substantive due process, freedom of contract, and taking without just compensation.

ANSWER TO SUMMONS AND NOTICE OF ATTORNEY FEE LIEN Page 1 of 3

168257/2700.234.0000

5. All defenses raised by any and all defendants in this case or that have been asserted or could be asserted in this case or any other common fund case pending before this Court or the Montana Supreme Court.

For the reasons set forth above and asserted by other defendants, Valor objects to common fund certification in this case.

DATED this Last day of June, 2005.

BROWNING, KALECZYC, BERRY & HOVEN, P.C.

Leo S. Ward

ATTORNEYS FOR Valor Insurance Co.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the day of June, 2005, a true and correct copy of the foregoing was this day deposited in the United States mail, postage prepaid, addressed to:

Thomas Murphy Murphy Law Firm P.O. Box 3226 619 Second Ave South Great Falls, MT 59403-3226

BROWNING, KALECZYC, PERRY & HOVEN, P.C